



CITY OF NEWTON, MASSACHUSETTS

Department of Planning and Development
Michael J. Kruse, Director

Telephone
(617)-796-1120
Telefax
(617) 796-1142

David B. Cohen
Mayor

MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS CHESTNUT HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

DATE: April 18, 2008

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 202
7:30pm

ATTENDING: John Wyman, Chairman
Livi Brill, Member
Lois McMullin, Member
William Roesner, Member
Merle Winer, Alternate Member
Donald Lang, Alternate Member
Brian Lever, Staff
See Attendance List

The meeting was called to order at 7:30 pm. Voting permanent members were Wyman, Brill, McMullin, and Roesner. Alternate members Winer and Lang also voted. The meeting was taped on 2 tapes.

33 Gate House Road– Certificate of Appropriateness.

The applicant Ellen Epstein and James McGrath presented a revised application involving the replacement of 14 windows with Pella Wood frame divided lite windows with interior spacers. Four on the south side, 6 on the east side, 3 on the north side and 1 on the west side. New windows will replace the existing metal windows with wood frames with black aluminum clad exteriors of the same size and shape as the existing windows fitted within the same rough openings. Epstein presented materials to the commission including window details and photographs. Brill stated that the existing windows maintained the character of the building with regards to its vertical lines. Roesner stated that the proposed windows were not appropriate to the building. Lang stated that replacement windows replicating the original windows may be too dark given the small pane size. Winer and Wyman stated that they felt the proposed windows were appropriate.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 18, 2008 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by vote of 4-2

RESOLVED to grant a certificate of appropriateness for the replacement of 14 windows based upon the designs for the replacement windows presented at the meeting. Windows are located as follows: four on the south side, six on the east side, three on the north side, and one on the west side.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chairman	Lois McMullin, Member
Merle Winer, Alternate Member	Donald Lang, Alternate Member

Voting in the Negative:

Liviu Brill, Member	William Roesner, Member
---------------------	-------------------------

26 Acacia Avenue- Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. and Mrs. James Jumes presented updated conceptual designs for their proposed additions to their home. Three designs were presented including the design from the March meeting, a new hip roofed design, and a new gable roofed design for the garage addition. James Jumes stated that the hip roof design gave relief to the adjacent homeowner. Jumes compared widths between houses on Acacia Avenue. Commission members suggested that reducing the rear box on the gable design would be more appropriate. Abutter Carol Anne Miller stated that Jumes had begun construction on a rear deck addition. Wyman stated that while this would likely be given a certificate of non-applicability but an application must be received first in order to avoid a violation. Bruce Miller stated that while Jumes had gone through great effort, the designs presented were not appropriate. Elizabeth Caan neighbor, also opposed the addition. Lang stated that distance between homes was a large part of the character of the street and that the proposed addition would alter the character. Lang also suggested utilizing the back yard for space. Wyman motioned to deny the application.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 18, 2008 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by vote of 6-0

RESOLVED to deny a certificate of appropriateness for the proposed 2-story addition with a 13-foot set back on the grounds that the presented designs are visually inconsistent with the street and impacts the neighbors.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chairman	Lois McMullin, Member
Merle Winer, Alternate Member	Donald Lang, Alternate Member
Liviu Brill, Member	William Roesner, Member

Brill stated that the conceptual drawings were difficult to work with, without being able to see the proposed walls and difficult to visualize. Brill requested that future applications have elevations and a site plan. Roesner also suggested building in the back of the property.

25 Acacia Avenue- Certificate of Appropriateness

Elizabeth and Geoff Caan presented designs for replacing their basement windows with Pella wood windows with simulated true divided lites. Commission members discussed the windows and window wells.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 18, 2008 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by vote of 6-0

RESOLVED to issue a certificate of appropriateness for replacement of the basement windows based upon the design presented at the meeting.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chairman	Lois McMullin, Member
Merle Winer, Alternate Member	Donald Lang, Alternate Member
Liviu Brill, Member	William Roesner, Member

Commission member Winer left the meeting at 9:00.

26 Nancy Road- Certificate of Appropriateness

Marina Banuazizi and landscape architect Ginna Johnson presented a landscape plan for 26 Nancy Road. The proposed driveway will be cobbles with asphalt. A sloped granite block wall will run along the driveway to the street. Bluestone walkway and stairs are also proposed. Wyman suggested that the design was perhaps not rustic enough. Lang stated that he had similar stairs and felt that they were rustic. Commission members proposed using granite. Brill and Wyman stated that they preferred granite. Johnson stated that no wall would be used along the front and that the yard would slope down to the street in character with the rest of the neighborhood.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 18, 2008 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by vote of 5-0

RESOLVED to issue a certificate of appropriateness for proposed landscape plan presented at the meeting signed by the chair dated 4/17/08 with the homeowner having the option to use granite in whole or in part for the walkway and steps instead of bluestone.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chairman	Lois McMullin, Member
Donald Lang, Alternate Member	Liviu Brill, Member
William Roesner, Member	

147 Chestnut Hill Road - Certificate of Appropriateness

Wyman stated that the north elevation of this home was visible from Beacon Street and that the commission would have jurisdiction over sections of the building visible from a public way and would make recommendations on sections not visible from a public way. Bruce Dayton (applicant) and Chris Dallmus (architect for the applicant) presented plans that would eliminate the 20th century 3rd floor dormers, remove the bluestone caps and rebuild chimneys in kind, and construct four new gable end dormers. Lang suggested the applicant review the Inspectional Services dormer policy. Brill asked if the dormers being removed were original to the house? Dayton responded that he did not know. Lang suggested that the servant's wing keep a separate style and identity from the rest of the house. The commission suggested reducing the glazing on the servant's wing. Wyman asked for an extension of time for the applicant to research the dormers proposed to be removed as to whether or not they are original. Alderman Baker (in attendance) stated that the Zoning and Planning Committee had recently passed a new dormer policy and that the applicant should review it. Dayton agreed to an extension of time, the application will be reviewed again at a later date.

70 Suffolk Road Informal Discussion Item

Alderman Baker brought to the commission's attention a drainage issue on Suffolk Road. Due to the lack of curbing and slope of the street, the property at 70 Suffolk Road receives water overflow running down the street. The Public Works Department/Engineering suggested granite curbing or an asphalt curb/burm. Baker stated that the Chestnut Hill District Commission should be consulted to the property owner and public works. Baker also stated that the property owner was considering paying for curbing to be install along the entire front of his property in addition to any work proposed by public works. Wyman stated that he felt the commission had jurisdiction because the curbing was a structure proposed

within the district. Roesner asked if there was a sidewalk? Baker replied that there was not, but that the City of Newton did have an easement. Wyman stated that granite curbing seemed too urban. Brill stated that there were different types of granite curbing and one might be found that works. Wyman stated that the property owner should coordinate with public works and the commission.

Wireless Antennas Informal Discussion Item

Alderman Baker brought to the commission's attention a proposal to have citywide wireless internet, sponsored by the city. This would involve the installation of telecommunications equipment across the city. Antennas would be installed on existing telephone poles. As part of the contract with the company to provide the service, review of these installations within historic districts by historic district commissions would be excluded. Commission members objected to the proposal to be denied review authority. Baker stated that he would mention their views to the other Alderman.

Meeting was adjourned at 11:00.

Recorded by Brian Lever, Commission Staff
Minutes approved at 8/21/08 meeting.