



# CITY OF NEWTON, MASSACHUSETTS

Department of Planning and Development  
Michael J. Kruse, Director

Telephone  
(617)-796-1120  
Telefax  
(617) 796-1142

David B. Cohen  
Mayor

---

## MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS CHESTNUT HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

**DATE:** May 29, 2008

**PLACE/TIME:** City Hall, Room 202  
7:30pm

**ATTENDING:** John Wyman, Chairman  
Livi Brill, Member  
Joyce Dostale, Member  
William Roesner, Member  
Merle Winer, Alternate Member  
Brian Lever, Staff  
See Attendance List

The meeting was called to order at 7:35 pm. Voting permanent members were Wyman, Brill, Dostale, and Roesner. Alternate member Winer also voted. The meeting was taped on 1 tapes.

### 262 Beacon Street– Certificate of Appropriateness.

Mark Lewis from Boston College presented a proposal to replace the existing slate roof with laramite composite shingles designed to resemble slate. Lewis provided photos of a similar installation at 11 Chestnut Hill Road. Lewis stated that the proposed material had a similar profile as slate and had a 50-year warranty. Brill asked if there was a structural problem with the building and if this was the reason for the change in materials? Lewis stated that there was no structural problem, but that the roof was damaged. Lewis stated that the cost of replacing the roof with the laramite material was 1/3 the cost of using slate. Winer asked if this material had been used before? Wyman stated yes and that he believed that there were two instances where faux slate roof material had been approved. Winer stated that she supported the use of the new material. Dostale stated that she was uncomfortable because 11 Chestnut Hill Road was viewed as an experiment for the new material. Wyamn stated that it was difficult to judge how well the material would last and that if it is a rubber product, the heat and sunlight might cause it to break down and become granular.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 29, 2008 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by vote of 4-1

RESOLVED to deny a certificate of appropriateness for the replacement of the existing natural slate roof with an artificial composite material designed to resemble slate for the following reasons: the proposed material is a new material not original to the home, the home is prominent and visible from a public way, and that the proposed material is untested and its durability is unknown.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chairman      Joyce Dostale, Member  
Livi Brill, Member      William Roesner, Member

Voting in the Negative:

Merle Winer, Alternate Member

Lewis asked if the commission would approve replacing the roof with slate. Staff stated that this could be done as an amendment to the denial in order to allow the application to proceed.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 29, 2008 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by vote of 5-0

RESOLVED to grant a certificate of non-applicability for the replacement of the existing slate roof in kind with an another slate roof and flashing to match the original.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chairman      Joyce Dostale, Member  
Livi Brill, Member      William Roesner, Member  
Merle Winer, Alternate Member

26 Acacia Avenue- Certificate of Appropriateness

James Jumes withdrew portions of his application pertaining to the rear addition and stated that he had hired a new architect and would be presenting a new plan for a rear and side addition at a later meeting. Jumes stated that he still wished to apply for the replacement of basement windows and alterations to the front walkway. The proposed replacement windows were Pella architectural grade windows. The proposed walkway was brick with brick stairs and bluestone risers. Roesner stated that a brick walkway might be difficult in the winter with the slope in the front yard. Jumes stated that he might need to put in an additional step. Roesner asked if the windows would be wood or clad. Jumes that they would be clad in white.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 29, 2008 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by vote of 5-0

RESOLVED to grant a certificate of appropriateness for the proposed basement replacement windows Pella Architectural grade simulated true divided light, two on the front and one on the left side as well as the proposed brick stairs, brick walkway, and bluestone risers, with the requirement that the plans be corrected and submitted to staff.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chairman      Joyce Dostale, Member  
Livi Brill, Member      William Roesner, Member  
Merle Winer, Alternate Member

147 Chestnut Hill Road - Certificate of Appropriateness

Architect Chris Dallmus and property owner Bruce Dayton presented a plan for new dormers, window replacements, and the addition of a pergola to this home. Dallmus presented photographic evidence showing that two of the dormers on the rear façade were not original to the home. These dormers will

be removed and replaced with four new dormers to match the existing center dormer. These dormers will be added to provide more light. Commission members stated that they were not sure of the visibility. Wyman stated that the upper portion of the rear of the home was visible from Beacon Street but that other sides were not and not subject to commission review. Dallmus stated that the existing chimneys would be rebuilt with the addition of metal dampers instead of the existing brick caps. Wyman stated that the pergola would likely only be minimally visible. For the front (southwest façade) Dallmus presented plans to add a Palladian style window to the center third floor dormer. Roesner stated that he felt the pergola was too high and objected to the Palladian window.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 29, 2008 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by vote of 5-0

RESOLVED to grant a certificate of appropriateness for the portions of the project visible from a public way including the windows, dormers, chimneys, and pergola located on the northern and eastern façades and northern end of the property. FURTHER RESOLVED to grant a certificate of non-applicability for the portions of the project not visible from a public way including the windows and dormers on the southern and western facades. LASTLY RESOLVED that the commission recommends against the use of the Palladian window in the third floor dormer on the southern façade.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chairman            Joyce Dostale, Member  
Livi Brill, Member                William Roesner, Member  
Merle Winer, Alternate Member

58 Reservoir Avenue - Certificate of Appropriateness

Carol Rubin presented plans for the remodeling of her bathroom and other improvements to her home. The proposed work involves the replacement of windows, addition of skylights, replacement of the roof, and the installation of a solar tube. Commission members reviewed the plans. Wyman suggested the use of architectural grade shingles instead of asphalt shingles.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on May 29, 2008 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by vote of 5-0

RESOLVED to grant a certificate of appropriateness based upon the plans as proposed with the applicant having the option of using architectural grade shingles instead of asphalt shingles.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chairman            Joyce Dostale, Member  
Livi Brill, Member                William Roesner, Member  
Merle Winer, Alternate Member

Minutes

The commission unanimously approved minutes from August 16, 2007, August 17, 2006, February 15, 2007, March 15, 2007, April 19, 2007.

Meeting was adjourned at 9:15.

Recorded by Brian Lever, Commission Staff  
Minutes approved at 8/21/08 meeting.