



CITY OF NEWTON, MASSACHUSETTS

Department of Planning and Development

Telephone

(617)-796-1120

Telefax

(617) 796-1142

Setti D. Warren
Mayor

MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS CHESTNUT HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

DATE: February 18, 2010

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 202
7:30pm

ATTENDING: John Wyman, Chair
Joyce Dostale, Member
Livi Brill, Member
Peter Vieira, Alternate
See Attendance List

William Roesner, Member
Lois McMullin, Member
Robert Imperato, Member
Brian Lever, Staff

The meeting was called to order at 7:30pm with John Wyman presiding as Chair. Voting permanent members were Wyman, Roesner, Dostale, McMullin, Brill, and Imperato. Alternate member Vieira also voted. The meeting was recorded on two tapes.

10 Stone Avenue – Certificate of Appropriateness

Mark Lewis, Oliver Radford, and Steve Perry representing Boston College submitted an application amending a previous approval. The revised changes included the addition of copper roofs on small sections of the roof, installation of exhaust vents and louvers, replacement of the square copper gutters with round copper gutters and installation of snow guards and lightning protection. Radford stated that the addition of the copper roof sections copper gutters would be minimally visible. Brill asked if the dormers would retain their slate roofs and Radford responded that they would. Abutter Geoff Caan asked if there would be lighting on the rear of the house. Radford stated that there would be a back porch light and described the lighting around the property including a proposed lamp near the driveway the Commission had not yet reviewed. Commission members reviewed the proposed lamp and stated that as proposed, a 13-foot high lamp was very tall. Lewis offered to retract that item and return to have it reviewed in the future. Wyman moved to offer a certificate of appropriateness excluding the lamp and Brill seconded.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on February 18, 2010 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by vote of 7-0,

RESOLVED to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as submitted excluding the proposed driveway lamp.

Voting in the Affirmative:

John Wyman, Chair	William Roesner, Member
Joyce Dostale, Member	Lois McMullin, Member
Livi Brill, Member	Robert Imperato, Member
Peter Vieira, Alternate	

136 Beacon Street– Certificate of Appropriateness

Mark Lewis and George Schnee representing Boston College presented an application to repair and replace the front portico, remove the patios flanking the portico, replace windows, and replace stairs and walkways. Schnee stated that the portico would be rebuilt to match existing, but use synthetic materials including fiberglass columns and Azek trim. Proposed replacement windows were vinyl simulated divided lite windows. A second floor door to the portico was also proposed to be replaced with a vinyl window. Brill asked if the stucco siding would remain? Schnee stated that it was in good shape and would be maintained. Brill stated that the Commission has not in the past been in favor of synthetic materials. Wyman inquired about the shutters. Schnee stated that they would be stripped and repainted and those that are deteriorated would be replaced with matching wood shutters. Schnee also stated that a flat section of the roof would be replaced with EPDM rubber roofing. Commission members discussed the proposed balustrade on the portico and options of either a wood balustrade or wrought iron railing. The Commission expressed reservations about the widespread use of synthetic materials. Wyman moved to issue a certificate of appropriateness excluding the replacement of the windows and McMullin seconded.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on February 18, 2010 the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission, by vote of 0-7,

RESOLVED to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as submitted excluding the replacement of the windows.

Voting in the Negative:

John Wyman, Chair	William Roesner, Member
Joyce Dostale, Member	Lois McMullin, Member
Liviu Brill, Member	Robert Imperato, Member
Peter Vieira, Alternate	

Motion fails, application is denied.

Commission members stated that the reasons for denial were the use of historically inappropriate materials and the lack of sufficient evidence that synthetic materials would appear and maintain an appearance the same as the existing wood exterior features. The Commission invited the applicant to return with a revised application at a later date.

26 Acacia Avenue– Certificate of Appropriateness Amendment

James Jumes presented alternative designs for the front façade of the previously approved attached garage as well as information regarding discrepancies in the existing conditions and approved plans. Jumes stated that the initial plans from which the addition was based were drawn incorrectly and that the error created an addition that is larger than was anticipated. Commission members noted inconsistencies with the drawings and the proposed alternatives. Wyman stated that this might be a case for a hardship certificate. Brill stated that the Commission should not design the proposed alternatives, but be presented with an option to review. Wyman stated that a complete set of plans showing the resulting changes to all facades as well as the approved drawings and one proposed solution should be submitted by the agenda deadline. Wyman further stated that Commission site visit might be needed. No action was taken on this item.

33 Lawrence Road – Certificate of Appropriateness

Architect Alan Joslin presented an application for the property owner to demolish the home at the property and install a 4-foot metal mesh perimeter fence painted black at northern property boundary and wooden gate at the driveway entrance, as well as remove wooden post and rail fence and replace it with a 6-foot cedar perimeter fence at southern property boundary. Responding to the Commission's previous comments the proposed gate was changed to an open wooden board gate. Joslin stated that the

perimeter fence would eliminate a need for a fence surrounding the pool. Commission members expressed concern over the types of fences proposed and stated that while an open fence was preferable, a chain link fence was not. Commission members suggested exploring the use of a wrought iron fence. Brill stated that the demolition of the home presents a limited benefit. Wyman stated that the demolition of the home was a benefit, but that the openness could be compromised by the other proposed alterations. Dostale stated that there was not enough benefit to the house being removed. Abutters Dick Turner and Annabelle Ambrose expressed support for the demolition of the home. Wyman suggested incorporating the Webster Estate playhouse located on the neighboring Jick property. Roesner suggested that a site plan of the neighborhood including the existing fences would be helpful. The applicant consented and this item will be continued at the next meeting.

Administrative Discussion:

The Commission unanimously approved the minutes from January with corrections and Imperato abstaining.

The Commission discussed the Planning and Development Board's request for a letter of support for proposed scenic road regulations. The Commission expressed concern over the jurisdiction on private property stating that the proposed regulations were vague on that point. No action was taken on this item.

Meeting was adjourned at 11:00.

Minutes approved at the March 18, 2010 meeting.